

NEWARK AND SHERWOOD DISTRICT COUNCIL

Minutes of the Meeting of **Planning Committee** held in the Civic Suite, Castle House, Great North Road, Newark, Notts, NG24 1BY on Tuesday, 5 June 2018 at 4.00 pm.

PRESENT: Councillor D Payne (Chairman)
Councillor P Handley (Vice-Chairman)

Councillor Mrs K Arnold, Councillor R Blaney, Councillor Mrs C Brooks, Councillor B Crowe, Councillor Mrs M Dobson, Councillor P Duncan, Councillor J Lee, Councillor Mrs P Rainbow, Councillor F Taylor, Councillor Mrs L Tift, Councillor I Walker, Councillor B Wells and Councillor Mrs Y Woodhead

APOLOGIES FOR None

ABSENCE:

1 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS AND OFFICERS

Councillor Frank Taylor declared a Personal Interest in Agenda item 17- Flash Farm, Micklebarrow Farm, Averham – 18/00433/FUL as he knew the applicant.

2 DECLARATION OF ANY INTENTIONS TO RECORD THE MEETING

The Chairman informed the Committee that the Council was undertaking an audio recording of the meeting.

3 MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

The Committee considered the minutes of the meeting held on 8 May 2018.

AGREED that the minutes of the meeting held on 8 May 2018 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

4 ORDER OF BUSINESS

With the agreement of the Committee, the Chairman changed the order of business as follows: Agenda Item 8, 5, 6, 13, 7, 16, 14 & 15, 16, 17, 18, and 19. Agenda Items 9, 10 and 20 were withdrawn from the agenda.

5 LAND WEST OF WATERFIELD WAY, CLIPSTONE - 17/02051/RMAM

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for the erection of up to 100 Residential Units, Structural Landscaping, Open Space Provision and Access Roads. The proposed development of 100 dwellings would occupy the north part of the site and represent approximately 3 Ha of the overall 5.4 Ha site area (Phase 1). Phase 2 would occupy the south part of the site with a separate full application for 72 dwellings currently pending determination. Officers further recommended a 'Grampion' type condition to secure use of the access road for the development to ensure the access to roundabout serving Cavendish Way was brought into use (by construction traffic and other vehicles accessing the site) prior to the commencement of development.

Councillor Paul Peacock, Local Ward Member, was in attendance to address the Committee. He raised concerns regarding the over intensification of the site, the proximity to existing dwellings, impact of additional car movements and the need for affordable housing. It was also noted that money had been identified for provision of a bus stop, however, there was no bus service to the estate.

Councillor Mrs Celia Brooks, also Local Ward Member, also raised concern with regard to the lack of amenities for people living on the estate and subsequent reliance on a car to access local services. She expressed her wish for increased green space on the estate, and also noted the amount of traffic using the proposed access road for tourism in the area.

The Committee considered the application, and were in agreement that a Grampian condition should be used to ensure that the road accessing the proposed development be adopted and used for construction traffic. Members were also minded to ensure that when applications were subsequently received for the remainder of the site, officers should work to secure relevant developer contributions, and focus this towards affordable housing. It was proposed and duly seconded to grant planning permission.

Members noted that a landscaping scheme was required, and it was proposed to place additional planting along boundaries. Concerns were raised with proposed parking to the rear of properties and the isolation of the proposed development from the village.

AGREED (9 For and 6 Against) that Planning Permission be granted subject to the conditions in the report including the addition of an extra condition to ensure the access to roundabout serving Cavendish Way is brought into use (by construction traffic and other vehicles accessing the site) prior to the commencement of development.

6 J HARRISON LTD, SOUTHWELL ROAD, LOWDHAM - 17/01616/FUL

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for change of use of existing car workshop/showroom and outdoor sales to local convenience store (Retail A1) incorporating relocation of Gonalston Farm Shop (Retail A1), ancillary coffee shop franchise and new local allotment provision. Members at the April Planning Committee agreed to defer the application pending the submission of Retail Impact Assessment (RIA), which had now been received. Members heard detail of the Retail Impact Assessment, which had found that the proposed development would not have an adverse impact on Lowdham Town Centre. Members' attention was drawn to the late items report, which also detailed the officer's recommendation to approve the application, which differed from the recommendation published in the original report to Members.

Councillor R. Blaney, Local Ward Member was in support of the application, noting that the local farmshop would attract customers from a wider area than Lowdham. The Committee considered the application and were in general support.

AGREED (unanimously) that Planning Permission be granted subject to the conditions detailed in the late report and subject to the completion of a S106 revoking the existing farm shop permission and the addition of an extra condition requiring details of how the car park will be split between the shop and garage site uses.

7 LAND AT TOLNEY LANE, NEWARK ON TRENT - 17/02087/FUL

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration which sought change of use of land to a private gypsy and traveller caravan site consisting of one mobile home, one amenity building and two touring caravans and associated works.

Councillor Matthew Skinner, Newark Town Council, was in attendance to address the Committee, speaking in opposition to the application due to the risk of flooding on the site, as it was in Flood Zone 2, and access was in Flood Zone 3.

Councillor Bob Crowe, Local Ward Member spoke against the application, noting the extant enforcement notice on the proposed, and the location of the site in flood zone three, with access in flood zone three. He felt that the proposal would present additional burden on the local authority with regard to emergency planning. He therefore proposed to refuse the application, in line with officer recommendation.

Other Members shared the concerns regarding the potential risk to life in a flooding event, and noted there were plans in place which sought to manage the flooding risk, and further developments on the site would increase the risk to life during a flooding event.

However, other Members felt that the community were aware of the flooding risks and could manage these. The community clearly wanted to be on that site and some Members felt that one additional pitch on the site would not place significant additional burden on the local authority with regard to emergency planning procedures.

The motion to refuse the application, in line with officer recommendation was put to the vote, and fell, with 7 for and 8 against.

It was therefore proposed and duly seconded to approve planning permission, against officer recommendation.

AGREED (9 For, 6 Against) Approve contrary to officer recommendation subject to conditions including the submission and approval of a full evacuation plan and details of flood risk mitigation measures (e.g. amenity block to allow flow of water underneath).

In accordance with paragraph 12.5 of the Planning Protocol, as the motion was against Officer recommendation, a recorded vote was taken.

Councillor	For	Against	Abstention
Kath Arnold			
Roger Blaney			
Celia Brooks			
Robert Crowe			
Maureen Dobson			
Peter Duncan			
Paul Handley			
Johno Lee			
David Payne			
Penny Rainbow			
Frank Taylor			
Linda Tift			
Ivor Walker			
Ben Wells			
Yvonne Woodhead			

8 7 BOWBRIDGE ROAD, NEWARK ON TRENT - 18/00591/FUL

Councillor Lee left the meeting prior to consideration of this item.

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager - Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for Conversion of residential property Use Class (C3 Dwellinghouses) to an 8x bed HMO Use Class Sui Generis (Houses in multiple occupation) & 3 Storey Side Extension & Ground Floor Rear Extension.

Councillor Matthew Skinner, Newark Town Council, was in attendance to address the Committee, speaking in opposition to the application due to the impact upon highway safety and over intensification of the site.

Councillor Bob Crowe, Local Ward Member, spoke against the application due to the additional impact the vehicles associated with the development would create on parking and accessing the site. He noted that this was already a very busy road with a busy junction close by.

Members were in general agreement that the proposed development was not appropriate for the site. That area of Bowbridge road was already extremely busy with traffic and Members also felt that the proposal would negatively impact on the amenity of the adjoining property.

AGREED (unanimously) that planning permission be refused contrary to officer recommendation due to adverse impact on the amenity of the adjacent dwelling arising from the increased intensification of the use of the site which has inadequate parking and access which would result in increased congestion in the area.

9 LAND TO THE REAR OF 37 AND 39 HALLOUGHTON ROAD, SOUTHWELL- 17/00771/FUL

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager - Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for the erection of one detached dwelling with attached garage. The application was withdrawn from the agenda of 5 December 2017 Planning Committee meeting with an Officer recommendation of refusal. The application was withdrawn from the agenda prior to the meeting at the request of the applicant in an attempt to address the expressed highway concerns. Further delay to the decision ensued at request of the applicant on the proviso that amended plans would be submitted for consideration. No such plans had been received and the applicant confirmed on 27 April 2018 that the application should be determined as submitted.

Councillor Handley, Local Ward Member, spoke against the application due to highways concerns, drawing the Members' attention to detail within the highways officer report. It was proposed and duly seconded to refuse planning permission in line with officer recommendation.

Other members echoed the concerns raised, noting the footpath along the proposed access, which was also very narrow. Concern was also raised regarding the design and layout of the proposed property.

However, other Members felt that the access could be managed by the residents of the site and many properties existed with similarly narrow access.

AGREED (10 For, 3 Against, 1 Abstention) that Planning Permission be refused in accordance with Officer recommendation.

10 11 FRIEND LANE, EDWINSTOWE- 18/00139/FUL

This item was withdrawn from the agenda.

11 FORMER GARAGE SITE, THORPE CLOSE, CODDINGTON - 18/00413/FUL

This item was withdrawn from the agenda.

12 LAND TO REAR 90 MAIN STREET, BALDERTON - 18/00357/FUL

The Committee considered a report from the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for 4 one and a half story dwellings in the rear grounds of the Old Hall, Main Street, Balderton.

In considering the application, Members noted the protected trees within the grounds and the extant outline permission. Members also confirmed that the proposed development fell just below the threshold for the provision of affordable housing. Concerns were raised as there were no garages attached to the proposed development, and some Members agreed it would be likely that applications for garages would be submitted in future. Officers confirmed that permitted development rights could be removed by condition, and would therefore be subject to future planning applications.

AGREED (9 For, 5 Against) that Planning Permission be granted in accordance with Officer recommendation and subject to the conditions detailed within the report.

13 LAND ADJACENT LIME TREE HOUSE, HALAM HILL, HALAM - 18/00501/FUL

The Committee considered a report from the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration that sought planning permission for the Erection of a new detached dwelling and detached garage.

Councillor Andrew Paris, Halam Parish Council, was in attendance to address the Committee, to speak in opposition to the application, due to the overdevelopment of an area which the village had wished to remain as open space and preserve views to the Church.

After hearing the Officer presentation, and representations from the Parish Council, it was proposed and seconded that the application be deferred to enable further negotiation with the applicant.

AGREED (13 For, 1 Against) that the application be deferred to enable Officer to further consider the height of the proposal, to amend the application to include Street scene elevations to include Radley Terrace. Ridge height appears excessive and should be reduced.

14 BECHERS COTTAGE, BECHERS WALK, BURGAGE LANE, SOUTHWELL - 18/00669/FUL AND 18/00670/LBC

The Committee considered a report from the Business Manager - Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for a single storey pitched roof extension to the north of Bechers Cottage, conservation roof lights to new and existing roof slopes and associated Listed Building Consent.

Councillor Handley, speaking as Local Ward Member did not consider that the application was acceptable due to the siting in a conservation area and a significant site for Southwell. Councillor Mrs P Rainbow, Local Ward Member, also felt that the proposed application would impact negatively on the amenity of the neighbouring properties.

It was therefore proposed and duly seconded, to refuse planning permission and listed building consent.

AGREED (13 For, 1 Against) that the application and listed building consent be refused, contrary to Officer recommendations Refuse contrary to Officer recommendation for the same reasons as 17/01787/FUL and 17/02137/LBC.

In accordance with paragraph 12.5 of the Planning Protocol, as the motion was against Officer recommendation, a recorded vote was taken.

Councillor	For	Against	Abstention
Kath Arnold			
Roger Blaney			
Celia Brooks			
Robert Crowe			
Maureen Dobson			
Peter Duncan			
Paul Handley			
Johno Lee	-	-	-
David Payne			
Penny Rainbow			
Frank Taylor			
Linda Tift			
Ivor Walker			
Ben Wells			
Yvonne Woodhead			

15 PRIMROSE COTTAGE, MANSFIELD ROAD, EDINGLEY - 18/00543/FUL

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for the Siting of 1 no. lodge (modular building) to form annexe to Primrose Cottage.

Councillor Derek Bradford, Edingley Parish Council, was in attendance to address the Committee, speaking in opposition to the application. Although a neighbour of the site, he confirmed he would not be speaking in a personal capacity and the Committee was advised not to take into consideration any personal views, should any such views appear to be conveyed. He informed the Committee that the Parish Council was unanimously opposed to the proposed development, due to the size of the proposed development, impact on neighbouring properties and concern over the future use of the property.

Members of the Committee raised concern over the application, echoing those of the Parish Council. Members were concerned over the local need aspect identified by the applicant, and of the potential future use of the annexe. The proposed unit was also large and sited close to the boundary with the potential to impact on trees in the surrounding area.

AGREED (unanimously) to Refuse Planning Permission, contrary to Officer recommendation as the annexe is not considered ancillary to the main dwelling therefore contrary to SP3, the style of the building is not in keeping with the area, it is too large and its positioning on site would be cramped and impact on trees.

16 FLASH FARM, MICKLEBARROW HILL, AVERHAM - 18/00433/FUL

Councillor Wells and Mrs Dobson left the meeting at this point.

Councillor Taylor declared a Personal Interest in the application, as he knew the applicant.

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration which sought Planning Permission for the Conversion of Traditional Agricultural Building to B1 Office Use with Associated Access and Parking.

The Committee considered the application and felt it to be acceptable, with an additional condition relating to the cutting back of the verges and hedgerows to ensure highway visibility.

AGREED (unanimously) that Planning Permission be granted in accordance with Officer recommendation and subject to the conditions detailed in the report, and an additional condition relating to provision of visibility splays.

17 NEWARK LORRY PARK, GREAT NORTH ROAD - 18/00636/FUL

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager - Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for Provision of free standing Classroom, Tool Store, Portaloo and installation of removable training test track.

The Committee considered the application and found it to be acceptable. It was proposed and duly seconded to approve planning permission in line with officer recommendation.

AGREED (unanimously) that the application be granted planning permission with the Conditions detailed in the report.

18 ROBIN HOOD VIEW CARAVAN PARK- BILSTHORPE - 17/01451/FUL

The Committee considered a report from the Business Manager- Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for removal/variation of condition 4 attached to planning permission 17/00147/FUL and Works to facilitate the siting of up to 15 additional caravans for holiday use. Officers apologised for issuing planning permission 17/00147/FUL with incorrect wording on Condition 4, and confirmed that the wording could not be changed retrospectively. The application therefore sought removal of Condition 4 and sought to control occupancy of the site with remaining conditions 5 and 6.

Some Members were supportive of the proposal, and sought clarification from Officers that the register of tenants in the caravans was kept, as per the existing conditions. Members were keen to ensure that the caravans were used by tourists and maintain turnover to improve tourism in the area. However, other Members felt that the application should be refused, and whilst there may be permanent caravans on site, use of them could be controlled with existing conditions and maintenance and checking of the register. It was therefore proposed and duly seconded to refuse planning permission.

AGREED (unanimously) that variation of the planning permission is refused contrary to Officer recommendation as Condition 4 is required to enable the use to provide for a more transitory use on the site in combination with the additional 30 pitches where this level of control was not in place. It was also important to retain adequate control over the use of the site to prevent caravans/motor homes being used as permanent residences.

19 PROPOSED CHANGES TO CONSTITUTION

This item was withdrawn from the agenda.

20 APPEALS DETERMINED

AGREED that the report be noted.

Meeting closed at 7.40 pm.

Chairman